

STRATEGY

SHELTER CLUSTER | WEST SUMATRA EARTHQUAKE RESPONSE

This document provides guidance for program implementation for existing and new agencies. It includes a short background as well as strategic positions. Specific recommendations are included in the executive summary.

This Shelter Cluster strategy has been prepared by the Shelter Cluster Coordination Team in consultation with SC members.

Version: **Wednesday, 28th April 2010**

Table of contents

1	Executive summary and recommendations	1
2	Introduction.....	4
3	Overall principles.....	4
4	Timeline and responding to changing needs.....	5
5	Cross cutting issues	5
6	Summary for working with Government policy	8
7	Range of Shelter Cluster agency activities	8
8	Advocacy support for IDPs	11
9	Reference documents	12

1 Executive summary and recommendations

1.1 Background

The IFRC-lead Shelter Cluster has been active in West Sumatra since the disaster in September 2009.

The Emergency Shelter Cluster was followed in January by an Early Recovery Shelter Cluster Coordination Team who handed over on 27/04/10 to a Shelter Working Group, led by UN-HABITAT, and to the Early Recover Network (ERN).

The activities of shelter cluster agencies can be broadly grouped into 4 categories:

- T-shelter programs with the specific output of a temporary shelter;
- T-shelter programs with a flexible range of options for households;
- Permanent Housing Support ie construction of part or full permanent houses; and
- Outreach and training.

There is also an emerging activity focus regarding:

- Repairs to damaged buildings.

Agencies are also working in associated programs such as, DRR, Build Back Better, and Water, Sanitation and Hygiene.

At the time of writing approximately 31 agencies are working in transitional shelter support, including temporary shelter and permanent housing support.

- **Further reading** - See annex section for 'Situation Report'.

1.2 Needs and recommendations

1.2.1 T-shelter support

As of writing, agencies and Government have targeted approximately 52,637 households for temporary shelter.

Recommendations for temporary shelter:

- That agencies planning to build temporary shelters should allow for a more flexible approach, responding the changing needs and beneficiary desires to direct their efforts towards permanent solutions and
- That agencies be mindful that there may be households living in structurally damaged houses for temporary shelter; and
- That there is a high likelihood that there are remaining pockets of households requiring temporary shelter.

1.2.2 Permanent Housing support

As of writing, agencies have targeted 10,375 households for permanent housing support:

- Permanent housing support by agencies: **2,902 households**
- Permanent housing support by Government: **7,473 households** (for the pilot project)

Recommendations for permanent shelter:

- That, given the limited number of proposed interventions that agencies spread their activities geographically to maximise the reach of training and information dissemination
- That agencies proactively provide alternative methods of construction, apart from confined-masonry, to households.

1.2.3 Training and outreach

There have been some efforts to consolidate training and outreach but these have effectively ceased. Previous outreach efforts focused primarily on posters, but largely ignored other opportunities such as newspapers, radio and television. Most of the agencies have included training components to their shelter projects, but there is without doubt a very large number of HH building their own homes, with no support.

Recommendations:

- That support be provided for those households making their own repairs or new construction in the way of training sessions, roaming teams of technical supervisors, model construction clinics at the village level etc.
- That agencies continue to advocate to government for wider training for affected HH

1.2.4 Repairs to damaged buildings

There is a strong self-recovery trend in rebuilding and the repair of damaged buildings. There is also very little clear advice and training for households attempting this. Some agencies are targeting this area but in very limited numbers. There are major concerns that poorly repaired buildings will pose high risks in future earthquakes

Recommendations:

- That a working group be established to address this specific area; and
- That to the maximum degree possible agencies and government should cooperate to maximise effective training and information for households repairing damaged houses.

1.2.5 IDPs

There are numbers of households in camps many of whom have become landless due mostly to landslides. It is not clear how long agencies currently supporting households in camps will continue that role. Conditions in some camp fall well short of 'Sphere' standards

Recommendations:

- That working groups and ERN actively seek out these communities and both monitor changing needs and respond accordingly both with shelter and community rehabilitation including PSP and VCA programs; and
- That advocacy for those households that are landless be continued with government.

1.2.6 Humanitarian standards

The need for promotion and adoption of minimum humanitarian standards in disaster response has been highlighted in West Sumatra.

Recommendations:

- That Sphere training be provided as soon as possible particularly targeting Government and local stakeholders; and
- That agencies adopt and promote Sphere standards in program activities.

1.2.7 Market impact

The rapid increase in reconstruction activity that will be associated with both agency and Government programs is predicted to impact on the price and availability of materials in particular timber. Anecdotal reports support this prediction.

Recommendations:

- That marketing analysis and impact study be undertaken using a tool such as EMMA This activity might be a requirement linked to donor funding.

1.2.8 Environment

Rebuilding shelters after a disaster use large volumes of natural resources, especially timber, which is increasingly difficult to obtain in Western Sumatra, and hence there are associated environmental impacts associated with harvesting of these natural resources.

Recommendations:

- That stakeholders engaged in shelter activities clearly identify the source of materials used and actively plan to mitigate against detrimental environmental effects
- That transitional shelter structures and associated facilities should be designed to be deconstructed and all materials involved reused for permanent housing or other productive purposes.

1.2.9 Gender

There are three main points for agencies to consider when undertaking projects in West Sumatra, namely: that there is a high number of female-headed households; that reconstruction and relocation policies must take into account women's customary land rights; and that there have been numerous reports of protection issues for women and girls in emergency and transitional shelter settings.

Recommendations:

- Include women, especially FHH in public meetings/consultations on design and distribution of cash grant;

- Collect and analyze and monitor sex-disaggregated data on beneficiaries to ensure that Female Headed Households are not missing out on the assistance;
- Deploy a gender balance team at the field level;
- Include both women and men in any technical training/information on house reconstruction, including equal opportunity for the both to work on house construction project; and
- Use the gender minimum standard guideline for the Recovery phase in West Sumatra as a reference.

2 Introduction

Following the earthquake in West Sumatra in September 2009, stakeholders moved quickly to support affected households.

In the relief phase householders received emergency support such as tarpaulins, food and non food items. This phase was declared over by Govt in November 2009.

After the emergency phase was over, agencies have redirected and strengthened their program in supporting the affected households with various shelter activities such as:

- T-Shelter (both specific and flexible programs);
- Permanent housing support; and
- Training and outreach.

The strategy itself is always in constant change due to the dynamic field situation and the government policy development. Meanwhile all agencies are trying to harmonize and adapt their plans and activities which mean all agencies, should have a common approach, and clear strategies on implementation as well as a viable exit plan.

3 Overall principles

The following over-arching principles should be applied to all programs.

All shelter and other related activities should as a baseline **adopt and promote** minimum humanitarian standards such as those articulated in Sphere.

All shelter activities will have earthquake resilience as a minimum standard.

Shelter interventions should be aware of and incorporate related issues such as:

- Increasing the capacity building of affected household and builders regarding safe construction;
- Impact on local economic growth;
- Impact on environment;
- Gender;
- Health; and
- Market impact.

Due to the large areas which have to be covered and the limited number of agency interventions all agencies should actively coordinate to fill gaps in needs and avoid potential overlapping problems.

To support government and community activities and ensure a smooth exit and hand over of their programs all agencies should harmonize their strategies to **district and provincial and national government** plans and policies.

Agencies should be particularly sensitive to the Government request that any intervention done by agencies should be guided by the Government approach in order to maintain equality and harmony in the community.

As the response by agencies particularly in Permanent Housing Support plans to reach a limited number of affected households agencies should wherever possible adopt an information dissemination approach and so both conduct activities as (geographically) widely as possible and develop dissemination materials and methods that can reach the maximum number of households

4 Timeline and responding to changing needs

The time line which starts from the earthquake in September and continues until the affected households rebuild their lives and their houses is difficult to predict and is undergoing constant change. Therefore agencies have to understand and incorporate the incremental steps that will be taken by different stakeholders to achieve a durable solution.

Agencies must make every effort to avoid the situation where program design and donor reporting obligations override the required flexibility to respond to the changing needs of the affected families

SCCT has produced a graphic to help understand the sequence of events and the roles of the different implementing stakeholders.

- **Further reading** - See annex section for 'Incremental progress towards recovery'.

5 Cross cutting issues

5.1 Guidelines from Environmental adviser to Shelter Cluster

The location and construction of post-disaster shelter should be based on the standards and guidance provided in Sphere Standards Chapter 4, Shelter, including Standard 6.

Environmental impact reviews are required for post-disaster shelter activities. Reviews can be programmatic for a whole emergency shelter operation or project specific (e.g., site-specific checklists). Programmatic reviews are recommended for those agencies still doing a large number of T-shelters and for those who will be undertaking permanent shelter assistance.

Negative environmental impacts associated with the provision of post-disaster shelter should be mitigated.

Materials from damaged buildings and damaged vegetation should continue to be considered as a first source for shelter construction and the use of these materials maximized.

Post-disaster debris clean-up activities should be based on recovering reusable materials, including the specific segregation of materials for reuse in emergency shelter, and the minimization of the volume of materials disposed of in landfills or through other means.

The use of locally available natural resources (e.g., sand, grass, wood) for shelter should be assessed for the impact on the local availability and sustainable use of these resources. As communities are mostly responsible for housing reconstruction in Western Sumatra, it is recommended that environmental awareness surrounding the use of these natural resources be done with them so that they can be used sustainably. This could be done by using local environmental NGOs who are familiar with 'socialisation' of the communities and disaster risk reduction could be further included.

The environmental sustainability of non-local shelter resources (e.g., roofing sheets, processed lumber, metal rods) should be assessed as part of programmatic planning for shelter. Sustainable sources should be used for all non-local shelter materials.

Emergency or transitional shelter structures and associated facilities should be designed to be deconstructed and all materials involved reused for shelter or other productive purposes.

Shelter materials should not be ordered or allowed to be shipped to a disaster affected area unless the specific need for these materials is justified.

The means used to ship shelter-related materials to a disaster area should be selected based on an assessment of the urgency with which the material is needed to save or maintain life and, the environmental impact of the means of transportation used for the shipment. Shipping of materials into Western Sumatra may be necessary as it is likely that because of strict logging legislation, and lack of adequate building materials, materials will have to be imported, at least from other provinces.

Where possible, the carbon contribution to shelter assistance should be calculated and off-sets incorporated into project budgets. These off-sets can be accomplished through the purchase of off-sets or through project-based activities (e.g., tree planting).

Shelter-associated livelihood recovery aid (e.g., training, tools), should incorporate an environmental impact assessment of how beneficiaries will use these skills or tools.

Post-disaster shelter activities should identify and incorporate analysis of environmental impact from other sectors, in particular water and sanitation. Even though the Wash cluster is no longer directly functioning in Western Sumatra. Provision of adequate potable water and adequate sanitation facilities will be of concern when reconstructing housing.

Assessment of the environmental impacts of immediate post disaster shelter assistance should incorporate consideration of the longer term recovery and reconstruction environmental impacts. Where these impacts cannot be accurately defined due to a lack of data or unclear reconstruction plans, possible issues should be signalled and noted for follow-up by the Early Recovery Cluster, or other appropriate party. It is hoped that the Environment Advisor for the Early Recovery Network will be able to follow up on working with the TPT facilitators in raising environmental awareness with communities and sustainable use of resources, as well as with agencies still working in this area.

5.2 Shelter related gender issues as identified by UN Gender adviser

There is a high number of female-headed households. Especially in Pariaman and Padang Pariaman, NGOs working at a village regularly commented on the high number of female headed households (for example more than 20% of the population in one Jorong) compared to the national average of 13.6% (Susenas, 2007). Any measurement should be developed to ensure that women headed households are not at risk of not able to access to all assistance and relevant information, including Government assistance which is usually distributed through a government structure at village level, Kepala Desa/Jorong (usually men) to the head of household – under Indonesian Marriage Law 1974, a husband is the head of a family.

Recommended actions are: 1) Include women, especially FHH in public meetings/consultations on design and distribution of cash grant; 2) Collect and analyze and monitor sex disaggregated data on beneficiaries to ensure that FHH are not missing out on the assistance; 3) Deploy a gender balance team at the field level; 4) Include both women and men in any technical training/information on house reconstruction, including equal opportunity for the both to work on house construction project; 5) Use the gender minimum standard guideline for the Recovery phase in West Sumatra as a reference.

Impacts of house reconstruction and relocation policies to women's customary land rights. It has been reported that in some areas, affected households have been asked to provide with building/construction permit to be able to receive assistance/grant to rebuild the damaged houses. Recently, with regards to IDPs situation, Oxfam identified around 1500-1800 IDPs households who are in need to be relocated. West Sumatra is recognised as an area with matrilineal lands transfer, therefore efforts related to T-shelter or permanent shelter reconstruction should accommodate customary land ownership under female's name –certified by Wali Nagari which can be used as a legal support to rebuild houses. Also, any advocacy and programming strategy should also carefully look at the impact of relocation policy on women's customary land rights.

The emerging of protection issues for women and girls. Gender based violence (including sexual harassment, rape and domestic violence) incident in IDPs sites setting has been reported. The recent report of Plan International's partners showed at least 18 cases of sexual harassment against girls in the past 12 months in North Pariaman, including cases occurred before and after the earthquake (in damaged houses/T-shelter). Special protective measurement should be developed for IDPs living in camps, especially those who have lost both their houses and lands and will continue staying in the camps for another year. To address the protection issues, temporary shelters should provide adequate space and privacy and should have a separate space between married couples and children. Any agencies working in camp management should integrate community based program on the protection of women and girls from GBV. It is recommended to use the gender minimum standard guideline for the Recovery phase in West Sumatra as a reference.

5.3 Human rights

Advocacy has been an issue raised at every cluster meeting, seeking input from the active agencies.

5.3.1 Minimum standards

A main area of concern has been the living conditions of households displaced by landslide or those households who do not have the resources to establish suitable temporary shelter. These groups, frequently accommodated in camps are in some cases enduring conditions well below minimum humanitarian standards.

To address this issue SCCT has raised the profile of Sphere standards.

As an ongoing strategy the SCCT strongly recommends the provision of Sphere Standards Training, particularly targeting non international stakeholders

5.3.2 Options for householders rebuilding with Government support

Another issue of engagement for the SC has been the probability that householders will have a limited range of options when meeting the conditions of the POKMAS system. There appears to be a strong government trend towards the confined masonry method of construction with the possible the exclusion of other systems such as timber, timber and masonry etc

There is evidence to support the proposition that confined masonry housing *built inadequately* through cost cutting or poor construction methods can be very dangerous buildings. The SCCT has worked consistently with shelter agencies and other stakeholders to promote the inclusion of alternative methodologies in the Govt Response plan and also for agencies to demonstrate other viable alternatives.

As well as this all stakeholders are urged to support government in providing both adequate training and readily accessible alternatives for approved buildings

5.4 Health

The health cluster was operational in Padang and the SCCT regularly attended inter-cluster coordination meetings. No specific shelter/health issues (including HIV/Aids) have been raised or identified.

Agencies with specific health objectives such as Handicap International have participated in cluster meetings and issues relating to disability were also investigated as an associated issue in the Kota Padang assessment.

The greatest shelter related risk to health appears to be households occupying damaged or poorly repaired buildings or general health and wellbeing issues exacerbated by long term occupancy of camps.

6 Summary for working with Government policy

The government program, as described in the reference documents, has the objective of providing support to every affected household. The complete rollout of this program is expected to take several years and funding lines and time frames are not completely resolved.

Agencies wishing to conduct permanent housing programs need to understand the government programs and progress and take care to design interventions that both harmonize with government programs, but also seek to identify and fill gaps.

As previously detailed a strongly identified need is for alternate designs and methods of permanent house construction as well as support to widespread up skilling of both householders and builders.

- **Further reading** - See annex section for 'Engagement with Government activities'.
- **Further reading** - See annex section for 'Government FAQs'.
- **Further reading** - See annex section for 'Government and Agency mechanisms'.

7 Range of Shelter Cluster agency activities

SCCT has fulfilled the following activities to coordinate Shelter programs. With the conclusion of the SCCT agencies and the shelter working group need to be proactive in continuing these basic functions:

These activities of shelter cluster agencies can be broadly grouped into 4 streams.

- T-shelter programs with the specific output of a temporary shelter;
- T-shelter programs with a flexible range of options for households;
- Permanent Housing Support ie construction of part or full permanent houses; and
- Outreach and training.

There is also an emerging activity focus regarding

- Repairs to damaged buildings.

Many agencies are working in several of these areas and include associated programs such as:

- DRR;
- Build back better; and
- Water and sanitation.

7.1 T-shelter programs (specific and flexible)

7.1.1 General information

T-shelter activities are the largest shelter intervention conducted, and started soon after the emergency phase. With budgets of approximately IDR 3 million per unit 37 agencies committed to providing support to more than 52,000 households.

As householders move emphasis from temporary shelter to reestablishment of permanent housing and as the government starts implementation of its cash grant program agencies have in some cases needed to consider more flexible approaches, although there still appear to be many households occupying inadequate or dangerous temporary accommodation.

7.1.2 Shelter Cluster strategy on supporting T-shelter construction

Ensure all agencies have complete information on and commitment to minimum humanitarian standards.

Provision/sharing of information on program coverage areas to avoid overlapping and identify gaps.

Negotiations as required to support reprogramming where overlaps or conflicts occur.

Working closely with the government and agencies in order to harmonize agencies strategies with government plans. SCCT has advised and supported agencies in adapting to the government plan and at the same time fulfil their commitment to communities and donors.

Collection of best practices done by agencies during the T-shelter implementation including a variety of approaches such as:

- Cash grant disbursement supported with reliable accountability system to use the money for affected household specific needs such as build a small shop or repair house.
- Providing construction material or carpenter cost.

Assisting agencies to modify their T-shelter intervention to more flexible approaches that respond to changing needs and circumstances.

7.1.3 Ongoing Challenges

Some challenges were met during the implementation programs and these potentially may continue:

- Conflict in area of activities - this situation can lead to competition amongst the NGO and beneficiaries and all efforts should be made to avoid this;
- Lack of local resources such as skilled carpenters hampering progress;
- Lack of understanding on government recovery mechanisms in the community causing worry that agency support may affect their eligibility on the government cash stimulus; and
- Difficulty on sourcing approved vendors for construction materials, particularly sourcing sustainable and legal supplies of timber.

7.2 Permanent Housing Support

A strategic advisory group for Permanent Housing Support (PHS) has been established and will continue as a working group.

- **Further reading** - See annex section for 'Permanent Housing Support Group'.

7.2.1 Agreed strategy of permanent housing support group (PHS)

That all activities of PHS will have a strong component of training.

That all projects will adopt earthquake resistant methodology.

That beneficiary selection will focus on the most vulnerable members of the community rather than on geographic location.

That the selection of beneficiaries will be community based i.e. selected by community.

That to every extent possible designs will be developed that offer affected households alternative designs and approaches to using the government cash stimulus package.

That all programs will make every effort to harmonize with and complement the government cash stimulus package.

That in line with Government policy agencies will endeavour to provide programs that have a unit value of approximately IDR 15 million.

- That there will be exceptions above but that these will be on the basis of specific additional outputs such as exploration of alternative technology or comprehensive start to finish training programs

That all programs will incorporate the development and dissemination of outreach materials to extend the reach of the program.

7.2.2 Suggested approaches

A working group continues to meet to exchange ideas, avoid overlaps, share methodology and information on budgets etc.

The group collates and shares all designs and working details BOQ etc.

Seek and promote house design using various construction materials such as:

- Confined masonry;
- Combination of bricks and timber;
- Combination of bricks with wooden plank wall or bamboo mat; and
- All timber structure.

Identify ways to modify designs in order the cost to meet the government cash stimulus which is IDR 15 million for new construction and IDR 10 million for house repair possibly using the following concepts:

- Both agencies and affected households should have flexibility offered on house design, construction material and method of implementation;
- Constructing a core or partial house, where affected households can self install non structural elements such as timber (or wooden plank) walls, doors and windows;
- Increased component of salvage materials;
- House built without toilet, but build communal toilet; and
- Building in stages (incremental construction) ensuring every design allows for extension as the beneficiaries have more resources and including safe engineering practice have to be apply on connecting old structure with the new structure.

7.3 Repairs to damaged buildings

Several agencies are working with or planning work with households who are repairing damaged buildings. This is potentially a difficult area and the SCCT recommends the formation of a working group for this specific activity with possible agenda items:

- How to promote good practices;
- Issues of liability if repairs performed poorly;
- Best practice;
- Monitoring; and
- Sharing of resources.

As the response in urban areas has been limited, any lessons learnt from programs that address urban issues should be shared via the shelter projects feedback process set up by SCCT. Any inquiries could be addressed to: sc.wj.coord@gmail.com.

7.4 Outreach and training

7.4.1 General information

Based on the damage assessment report, the government concluded that the majority of houses which collapsed or sustained severe damage did so due to improper construction practices. The cause may have been a lack of earthquake resilience structure knowledge or neglect of the appropriate engineering practices.

Therefore government is using a variety of approaches encourage households to prioritise earthquake safe construction ahead of other housing elements such house size or cost cutting.

7.4.2 Supporting outreach and training

The following initiatives will continue:

- Distribution of posters and DVD produced by cluster;
- Ongoing encouragement for agencies, in particular to those engaged in Permanent Housing Support (PHS) and repairs to damaged buildings to develop and disseminate materials;
- Where possible share materials with government and support its plans for training the local builders;
- Make representations to any donors willing too support outreach and training; and
- Agencies are also providing training affected household and local builders on construction techniques.

8 Advocacy support for IDPs

Reports from IOM, UN-OCHA and Oxfam have identified groups/camps of households in several locations many of whom have shelter concerns.

There is a clear need for agencies to support these affected communities both in provision of alternate (temporary) shelter and also in community rehabilitation.

The needs of landless households need to be addressed. Whilst Government is working in this area I(NGO) have a clear responsibility to monitor the situation of these households.

SCCT investigations have led to reports detailing needs and recommendations.

- **Further reading** - See annex section for 'Update on IDP situation'.

9 Reference documents

The following reference documents are available on the Google Group, under the 'Strategic documents' section.

- Situation Report;
- Incremental progress towards recovery (diagram);
- Engagement with Government activities;
- Government FAQs;
- Government and Agency mechanisms;
- Permanent Housing Support Group; and
- Update on IDP situation